

2014 Workers' Compensation Commissioners Survey

Commissioner Susan S. Barden

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 178 responses

Excellent – 34.3%

Good – 28.1%

Satisfactory – 24.7%

Deficient – 12.9%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 176 responses

Excellent – 31.8%

Good – 30.7%

Satisfactory – 22.1%

Deficient – 15.3%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 169 responses

Excellent – 20.7%

Good – 19.5%

Satisfactory – 30.8%

Deficient – 29%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 176 responses

Excellent – 50.57%

Good – 20.45%

Satisfactory – 16.48%

Deficient – 12.5%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 173 responses

Excellent – 27.17%

Good – 17.34%

Satisfactory – 17.34%

Deficient – 38.15%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 173 responses

Excellent – 28.9%

Good – 19.08%

Satisfactory – 27.17%
Deficient – 24.86%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 174 responses

Excellent – 25.9%
Good – 23.6%
Satisfactory – 21.8%
Deficient – 28.7%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 174 responses

Excellent – 40.8%
Good – 21.3%
Satisfactory – 23%
Deficient – 14.9%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 179 responses

Excellent – 38%
Good – 29.1%
Satisfactory – 24%
Deficient – 8.9%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 176 responses

Excellent – 44.9%
Good – 21.6%
Satisfactory – 27.8%
Deficient – 5.7%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 176 responses

Excellent – 44.3%
Good – 28.4%
Satisfactory – 20.5%
Deficient – 6.8%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 177 responses

Excellent – 42.94%
Good – 29.94%

Satisfactory – 23.73%
Deficient – 3.39%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 175 responses

Excellent – 49.14%
Good – 25.14%
Satisfactory – 22.29%
Deficient – 3.43%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 173 responses

Excellent – 43.4%
Good – 28.3%
Satisfactory – 23.1%
Deficient – 5.2%

Commissioner Scott Beck

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 172 responses

Excellent – 36.05%
Good – 36.05 %
Satisfactory – 19.19%
Deficient – 8.72%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 169 responses

Excellent – 33.7%
Good – 35.5%
Satisfactory – 20.7%
Deficient – 10.1%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 166 responses

Excellent – 30.7%
Good – 34.3%
Satisfactory – 20.5%
Deficient – 14.5%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 171 responses

Excellent – 43.27%
Good – 32.75%
Satisfactory – 18.71%
Deficient – 5.26%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 167 responses

Excellent – 28.7%
Good – 23.4%
Satisfactory -20.4%
Deficient – 27.5%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 168 responses

Excellent – 27.38%
Good – 30.36%
Satisfactory – 27.38%
Deficient – 14.88%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 167 responses

Excellent – 32.9%

Good – 27.5%

Satisfactory – 27%

Deficient – 12.6%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 169 responses

Excellent – 49.1%

Good – 23.1%

Satisfactory – 26%

Deficient – 1.8%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 172 responses

Excellent – 41.28%

Good – 31.4%

Satisfactory – 22.67%

Deficient – 4.65%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 170 responses

Excellent – 47.7%

Good – 28.2%

Satisfactory – 20.6%

Deficient – 3.5%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 170 responses

Excellent – 45.9%

Good – 28.8%

Satisfactory – 21.2%

Deficient – 4.1%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 171 responses

Excellent – 45.61%

Good – 32.75%

Satisfactory – 19.88%

Deficient – 1.75%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 168 responses

Excellent – 47.6%

Good – 31%

Satisfactory – 20.2%

Deficient – 1.2%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 168 responses

Excellent – 47.62%

Good – 29.76%

Satisfactory – 19.05%

Deficient – 3.57 %

Commissioner Melody James

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 148 responses
 - Excellent – 27.7%
 - Good – 43.24%**
 - Satisfactory – 24.32%
 - Deficient – 4.73%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 146 responses
 - Excellent – 29.45%
 - Good – 37.67%**
 - Satisfactory – 26.03%
 - Deficient – 6.85%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 144 responses
 - Excellent - 25%
 - Good – 33.33%**
 - Satisfactory – 31.94%
 - Deficient – 9.72%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 148 responses
 - Excellent – 43.2%**
 - Good – 31.1%
 - Satisfactory – 23%
 - Deficient - 2.7%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 145 responses
 - Excellent – 29.7%**
 - Good – 26.2%
 - Satisfactory – 24.8%
 - Deficient – 19.3%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 144 responses
 - Excellent – 32.6%
 - Good – 29.9%
 - Satisfactory – 33.3%**
 - Deficient – 4.2%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 146 responses

Excellent – 36.3%

Good – 33.6%

Satisfactory – 26%

Deficient – 4.1%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 146 responses

Excellent – 53.4%

Good – 24%

Satisfactory – 21.9%

Deficient – 0.7%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 148 responses

Excellent – 42.57%

Good - 36.49%

Satisfactory- 20.95%

Deficient - 0%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 147 responses

Excellent – 55.1%

Good – 29.25%

Satisfactory – 15.65%

Deficient - 0%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 146 responses

Excellent – 54.1%

Good – 30.8%

Satisfactory – 15.1%

Deficient - 0%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 147 responses

Excellent – 21.8%

Good – 28.6%

Satisfactory – 33.3%

Deficient – 16.3%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 146 responses

Excellent – 34.9%

Good – 34.3%

Satisfactory – 26.7%

Deficient - 4.1%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 146 responses

Excellent – 32.9%

Good – 34.9%

Satisfactory – 28.1%

Deficient – 4.1%

Commissioner Gene McCaskill

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 148 responses
 - Excellent – 6.1%
 - Good – 14.9%
 - Satisfactory – 38.5%
 - Deficient – 40.5%**

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 146 responses
 - Excellent – 4.8%
 - Good – 14.4%
 - Satisfactory -39%
 - Deficient – 41.8%**

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 140 responses
 - Excellent – 13.6%
 - Good – 25.7%
 - Satisfactory – 35.7%**
 - Deficient - 25%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 148 responses
 - Excellent – 46.6%**
 - Good – 21.6%
 - Satisfactory – 26.4%
 - Deficient – 5.4%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 146 responses
 - Excellent – 25.34%
 - Good – 20.55%
 - Satisfactory - 20.55%
 - Deficient – 33.56%**

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 144 responses
 - Excellent – 25.7%
 - Good – 22.2%
 - Satisfactory – 37.5%**
 - Deficient - 14.6%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 145 responses
 - Excellent – 31%
 - Good – 22.1%
 - Satisfactory – 31.7%**
 - Deficient – 15.2%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 145 responses
 - Excellent – 44.1%**
 - Good - 20%
 - Satisfactory – 26.9%
 - Deficient - 9%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 149 responses
 - Excellent – 47.6%**
 - Good – 25.5%
 - Satisfactory - 24.2%
 - Deficient – 2.7%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 147 responses
 - Excellent – 52.4%**
 - Good – 23.8%
 - Satisfactory – 23.1%
 - Deficient – 0.7%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 146 responses
 - Excellent – 55.5%**
 - Good – 21.2%
 - Satisfactory – 22.6%
 - Deficient - .7%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 146 responses
 - Excellent – 24%
 - Good – 39%**
 - Satisfactory – 28.8%
 - Deficient – 8.2%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 145 responses

Excellent – 33.8%

Good – 33.1%

Satisfactory – 30.3%

Deficient – 2.8%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 145 responses

Excellent - 32.41%

Good – 33.1%

Satisfactory – 30.34%

Deficient – 4.14%

Commissioner Andrea Roche

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 144 responses

Excellent – 72.9%

Good – 19.4%

Satisfactory – 6.3%

Deficient – 1.4%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 142 responses

Excellent – 73.24%

Good – 19.72%

Satisfactory – 4.93%

Deficient - 2.11%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 140 responses

Excellent – 59.3%

Good – 27.9%

Satisfactory – 10.7%

Deficient – 2.1%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 144 responses

Excellent – 58.3%

Good – 22.9%

Satisfactory- 17.4%

Deficient – 1.4%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 141 responses

Excellent – 46.81%

Good – 25.53%

Satisfactory – 17.73%

Deficient – 9.93%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 140 responses

Excellent – 49.3%

Good – 23.6%

Satisfactory - 20%

Deficient – 7.1%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 142 responses

Excellent – 57.04%

Good – 21.13%

Satisfactory – 16.2%

Deficient – 5.63%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 140 responses

Excellent – 70.7%

Good – 18.6%

Satisfactory – 8.6%

Deficient – 2.1%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 143 responses

Excellent – 62.9%

Good – 21.7%

Satisfactory – 13.3%

Deficient – 2.1%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 141 responses

Excellent – 65.96%

Good – 21.28%

Satisfactory – 11.35%

Deficient – 1.42%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 139 responses

Excellent – 66.9%

Good – 19.4%

Satisfactory - 10.8%

Deficient - 2.9%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 143 responses

Excellent – 54.55%

Good – 21.68%

Satisfactory – 18.88%

Deficient – 4.9%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 142 responses

Excellent – 59.2%

Good – 23.2%

Satisfactory – 13.4%

Deficient – 4.2%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 141 responses

Excellent – 55.3%

Good – 24.1%

Satisfactory – 15.6%

Deficient – 5%

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 134 responses

Excellent - 50%

Good – 31.3%

Satisfactory – 17.2%

Deficient – 1.5%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 134 responses

Excellent – 50.8%

Good – 31.3%

Satisfactory -13.4%

Deficient – 4.5%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 132 responses

Excellent – 36.36%

Good – 40.15%

Satisfactory – 18.18%

Deficient – 5.3 %

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 132 responses

Excellent – 50.76%

Good – 29.55%

Satisfactory – 18.18%

Deficient – 1.52%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 132 responses

Excellent – 39.4%

Good – 23.5%

Satisfactory – 22.7%

Deficient – 14.4%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 131 responses

Excellent – 38.17%

Good – 34.35%

Satisfactory – 19.08%

Deficient – 8.4%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 131 responses

Excellent – 47.3%

Good – 31.3%

Satisfactory – 16.8%

Deficient – 4.6%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 132 responses

Excellent – 61.36%

Good – 23.48%

Satisfactory – 15.15%

Deficient - 0%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 134 responses

Excellent – 58.2%

Good – 33.6%

Satisfactory – 8.2%

Deficient - 0%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 133 responses

Excellent – 62.4%

Good – 29.3%

Satisfactory – 8.3%

Deficient - 0%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 133 responses

Excellent – 65.4%

Good – 26.3%

Satisfactory – 8.3%

Deficient - 0%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 133 responses

Excellent – 19.55%

Good – 23.31%

Satisfactory – 25.56%

Deficient – 31.58%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 132 responses

Excellent – 34.1%

Good – 30.3%

Satisfactory – 26.5%

Deficient – 9.1%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 133 responses

Excellent – 40.6%

Good – 28.57%

Satisfactory – 27.07%

Deficient – 3.76%

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 152 responses
 - Excellent – 9.21%
 - Good – 19.74%
 - Satisfactory - 43.42%**
 - Deficient - 27.63%
2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 151 responses
 - Excellent – 9.93%
 - Good – 19.21%
 - Satisfactory – 39.74%**
 - Deficient - 31.13%
3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 149 responses
 - Excellent – 19.46%
 - Good – 32.89%
 - Satisfactory – 34.9%**
 - Deficient – 12.75%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 150 responses
 - Excellent – 41.33%**
 - Good – 25.33%
 - Satisfactory – 27.33%
 - Deficient - 6%
2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 151 responses
 - Excellent – 18.5%
 - Good – 20.5%
 - Satisfactory – 37.8%**
 - Deficient – 23.2%
3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 150 responses
 - Excellent – 16.67%
 - Good - 28%
 - Satisfactory – 34.67%**
 - Deficient – 20.67%
4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 151 responses

Excellent – 25.8%
Good – 21.9%
Satisfactory – 36.4%
Deficient – 15.9%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 149 responses

Excellent – 36.24%
Good – 24.83%
Satisfactory - 24.83%
Deficient – 14.09%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 152 responses

Excellent – 37.5%
Good – 30.3%
Satisfactory - 25%
Deficient - 7.2%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 151 responses

Excellent – 46.4%
Good – 29.8%
Satisfactory – 19.9%
Deficient - 4%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 151 responses

Excellent – 48.3%
Good – 28.5%
Satisfactory – 17.2%%
Deficient – 6%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 152 responses

Excellent – 30.3%
Good – 40.8%
Satisfactory – 24.3%
Deficient – 4.6%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 151 responses

Excellent – 37.1%
Good – 36.4%
Satisfactory – 23.2%
Deficient – 3.3%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 150 responses

Excellent - 36%
Good – 34.7%
Satisfactory - 26%
Deficient – 3.3%