**Commission on
Higher Education**

Dr. Conrad D. Festa
Executive Director

March 3, 2005

MEMORANDUM

To: Mr. Dalton B. Floyd, Jr., Chairman, and Members, Commission on Higher Education

From: Dr. Vermelle J. Johnson, Chairman, and Members, Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing

Consideration of Follow-up to Report on Program Productivity, Fall 1998-Fall 2003
Executive Summary

Background

In 2002 the South Carolina Commission on Higher Education (CHE) adopted a new policy on program productivity, which provides for the review of enrollment and degrees awarded in all degree programs on a biennial basis. This policy can be found on the CHE website (www.che.sc.gov) under Academic Affairs. Given the dynamic nature of the state's needs regarding academic programming, it is imperative that the Commission, in concert with the public institutions of higher learning, frequently assess the relevance and utility of its program offerings. The program productivity standards constitute a useful tool to do just that.

On July 8, 2004, the Commission on Higher Education met to consider the recommendations presented by the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing (CAAL) concerning the *Report on Program Productivity, Fall 1998-Fall 2003*. The members of the Commission voted to approve the staff recommendations for each of the programs that were non-compliant with program productivity standards. {**New Commission members will be sent copies of the *Report on Program Productivity, Fall 1998-Fall 2003* under separate cover.**}

Following Commission action, institutions were asked to provide to the CHE a written response concerning the institution's plans to enhance or improve programs that were recommended for provisional approval by September 30, 2004, as well as provide staff with a date by which the plan would be fully

1333 Main St. Suite 200 Columbia, S.C. 29201 Tel: 803-737-2260 Fax: 803-737-2297 Web: WWW.CHE.SC.GOV

implemented for re-evaluation for program productivity review. The attached report provides a list of the academic degree programs granted provisional approval status, institutional responses concerning plans of action to improve or terminate the noncompliant programs, and staff recommendations.

Evaluation Criteria and Policy

The policy and procedures for academic degree program productivity review require programs offered at public four-year institutions in the state to be evaluated in terms of a five-year rolling average for enrollment and degrees awarded. The following criteria apply:

Academic Degree Program Productivity Standards
(Five-Year Average Benchmarks)

Degree Level	Degrees Awarded	Major Enrollment
Baccalaureate	5	12.5
Master's/1st Professional/ Specialist	3	6
Doctoral	2	4.5

1. Each **Baccalaureate** program must produce an average of at least **five degrees** awarded and a headcount enrollment of **twelve and a half students** in the program over the most recent five-year period.

2. Each **Master's** program must produce an average of at least **three degrees** awarded and a headcount enrollment of at least **six students** in the program over the most recent five-year period.

3. Each **Doctoral** program must produce an average of at least **two degrees** awarded and a headcount enrollment of at least **four and half students** in the program over the most recent five-year period.

Under the new program productivity policy, each degree program at each senior institution will be reviewed on a biennial basis. As data sources, staff use the Commission on Higher Education Management Information System (CHEMIS) and the Commission's *Academic Degree Program Inventory*. **Academic degree programs that meet at least one of the two productivity standards automatically receive continuing approval status from the Commission.** Programs which fail to meet the above criteria are either terminated, placed on probation (i.e., provisional approval status), or exempted from program productivity standards.

Recommendations:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission:

1) Accept the plans of corrective action submitted by The Citadel, Lander University, USC-Columbia, USC-Upstate, and Winthrop University for programs shown in Table 1.

Table 1:
Plans of Corrective Action Requested for Noncompliant Programs
Granted Provisional Approval

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
The Citadel						
Bachelor	German Language & Literature	160501	10	2.6	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	French Language & Literature	160901	6.6	0.8	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Lander University						
Bachelor	Spanish Language & Literature	160905	12.2	1.6	Exemption	Provisional Approval
University of South Carolina-Columbia						
Bachelor	European Studies	50106	2	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Latin American Studies	50107	3.6	1.2	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master's	Health & Physical Education	310501	0.8	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
University of South Carolina-Upstate						
Bachelor	French Lang. & Literature	160901	3.6	0.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Mathematics	270101	9.2	1.6	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Winthrop University						
Master's	Art Teacher Education	131302	2.8	2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master's	Music Teacher Education	131312	3.2	2.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

3

Table 2:
Requests for Program Terminations &
Reconsideration of Program Status

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
Clemson University						
Master's	Biochemistry	260202	2.4	0.8	Reconsideration of Exemption	Exemption
University of South Carolina-Columbia						
Doctoral	Health Education Administration	130499	1.8	0	Termination	Termination
Master's	Music History & Lit.	500902	1.6	0.2	Reconsideration of Exemption	Exemption
Master's	Music Theory and Comp.	500904	5.6	1.2	Reconsideration of Exemption	Exemption
Winthrop University						
Master's	Mathematics	270101	3.8	1.8	Termination	Termination

2) Grant exemptions to the following:
   a. exemption for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Biochemistry** at **Clemson University** from program productivity standards. The Master's degree in Biochemistry is used as a "stop out" program for students who were originally enrolled in the doctoral program but chose not to complete the doctorate. The courses taken by students in the Master's program are the same courses that students are required to take in the doctoral program. Thus, no new courses are taught in the Master's program that are not needed for the doctoral program.
   b. exemption for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music History and Literature** and for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music Theory and Composition** at **USC-Columbia** from program productivity standards with USC-Columbia to provide a plan of action with deadlines for improving enrollment to the staff by May 13, 2005. Each of these programs is a unique program and the only one of its kind being offered by institutions in the state. Without their existence, there would be a void in these areas of study for students who are interested in pursuing degrees and careers in these fields. However, the Committee

4

felt that programs should be examined for their usefulness if student demand is so low.

3) Accept the proposed terminations as follows:
   a. termination for the program leading to a Doctoral degree in **Health Education Administration** at **USC-Columbia**.
   b. termination for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Mathematics** at **Winthrop University**.

I. Consideration of Follow-up to the Report on Program Productivity, Fall 1998-Fall 2003

Background

In 2002 the South Carolina Commission on Higher Education (CHE) adopted a new policy on program productivity, which provides for the review of enrollment and degrees awarded in all degree programs on a biennial basis. This policy can be found on the CHE website (www.che.sc.gov) under Academic Affairs. The Commission has implemented new criteria and procedures that are applied in this report. The attached report provides a list of academic degree programs that have been identified as noncompliant with program productivity standards based on enrollment and the number of degrees awarded. Campuses were asked to review identified programs, determine their continued viability, and report back to staff their intent with respect to the noncompliant programs. This report includes a list of the noncompliant academic degree programs granted provisional approval status, institutional responses concerning plans of corrective action to improve or terminate the programs, and staff recommendations.

Evaluation Policy and Procedures

The policy and procedures for academic degree program productivity review require that programs offered at public four-year institutions in the state be evaluated in terms of average enrollment and degrees awarded. The following criteria apply:

4. Each Baccalaureate program must produce an average of at least five degrees awarded and a headcount enrollment of twelve and a half students in the program over the most recent five-year period.

5. Each Master's program must produce an average of at least three degrees awarded and a headcount enrollment of at least six students in the program over the most recent five-year period.

6. Each Doctoral program must produce an average of at least two degrees awarded and a headcount enrollment of at least four and half students in the program over the most recent five-year period.

Each degree program at each senior institution is reviewed on a biennial basis. As data sources, staff use the CHE Management Information System (CHEMIS) and the Commission's *Academic Degree Program Inventory*. Academic degree programs that meet at least one of the two productivity standards automatically receive continuing approval status from the Commission. Programs which fail to

meet the above criteria are either terminated, placed on probation (i.e., granted provisional approval status), or exempted from program productivity standards.

Degree programs are placed on probationary status for up to a four-year period, during which time institutions will be expected to enhance degree program enrollment and degrees awarded. Institutions will have 60 days from the date of Commission action on initial probationary status to provide the Commission with a plan for enhancing the program to meet the degree program productivity policy within the four-year probationary period. At the end of the probationary period, the Commission will recommend continuing approval status for programs meeting program productivity standards and termination of programs that again fail to meet the standards. However, the Commission may remove probationary status from such programs as early as the next biennial degree program productivity review, if warranted.

On a program-by-program basis, the Commission will entertain exemptions to the academic program productivity standards, if appropriate justification can be provided. In most cases, programs approved for exemption will be considered essential to the basic mission of the American university (i.e., the arts and sciences) or deemed so unique in their subject matter and value to the higher education community in South Carolina as to make them essential to be offered, even if they typically do not meet the productivity standards.

Exemption requests must be made in writing to the Commission staff (see Procedure C.2 in the Policy) and must be approved by the chief academic officer and president of the institution. In most cases, the Commission will award exemptions for the lifetime of a degree program, unless an institution decides to terminate a program. Institutions may select noncompliant degree programs from any degree level for possible exemption. Institutions must re-petition for exempt status for programs that undergo curricular changes requiring Commission degree program modification approval as outlined in the *Guidelines for the Approval of New Academic Degree Programs*.

Summary of Process

The *Follow-up to the Report on Program Productivity Fall 1998-Fall 2003* is the second phase of the program productivity review process for the 1998-2003 academic years. During phase one, CHE staff identified academic degree programs at the public colleges and universities in the state that were not meeting program productivity standards based on enrollment and number of degrees awarded. Staff began work in September 2003 by collecting data and calculating the five-year averages for enrollment and for degrees awarded for each academic program in the public four-year institutions. In November 2003, each university

received a list of the noncompliant academic programs identified by the staff review for the 1997 to 2002 academic years.

The institutions were asked to review the list of programs and to submit any corrections to the data as well as inform staff as to whether each of the programs should be maintained in their current form, altered, terminated, or exempted. Once responses were received from the institutions and corrections were made to the data by CHE staff, the data was run again to include data for enrollment and completions for Fall 2003. Therefore, the list of noncompliant programs identified derives from data for the 1998 to 2003 academic years.

At its regular meeting on July 8, 2004, the Commission on Higher Education approved the recommendations of the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing concerning the *Report on Program Productivity, Fall 1998-Fall 2003* (see Table 1 in **Attachment 1**). Of the programs identified during the 1998-2003 review cycle, the institutions requested termination for eight programs, exemption for twenty-three programs, provisional approval for eight programs, and one program for full approval status. The CHE staff recommended eight programs for termination, twelve programs for exemption, eighteen programs to be placed on provisional approval status, and two programs to be granted full approval status. The members of the Commission voted to approve the staff recommendations for each of the programs that were noncompliant with program productivity standards, with the following exceptions:

1. At the request of USC-Columbia, the program leading to the M.Ed. degree in Educational Research at the institution was granted "exemption" status rather than "provisional approval" status.

2. At the request of S.C. State University, to defer action on S.C. State's programs until the University's major internal reorganization is complete, with the University to notify CHE staff by September 30, 2004, as to its program recommendations with any related new or modified program proposals to be submitted shortly thereafter and preferably by December 2004.

Following Commission action, institutions were asked to provide CHE staff with a written response concerning the institution's plans to enhance or improve programs granted provisional approval status to increase enrollment and degrees awarded in these fields of study. In addition, institutions were also asked to provide CHE staff with a date by which such plans of action would be fully implemented so as to allow for re-evaluation of the program's compliance with the productivity standards. CHE staff will review each of the programs again every two years, and institutions have up to two review cycles to improve programs to

bring them in compliance with productivity standards.

Summary of Overall Results, Fall 1998-Fall 2003

In 1993, CHE staff identified 36 programs at the state's four-year public colleges and universities as being noncompliant with program productivity standards then in effect. The Commission's current minimum standards for program productivity (enrollment and degrees awarded) were applied to programs that have been implemented for more than five years, to determine which programs failed to meet the established productivity standards. By comparison with the 1993 study, the 2004 study found that of the 763 programs offered at the state's twelve public senior universities, 40 programs (5.2 percent) were not in compliance with current program productivity standards.

Across the State's twelve public senior institutions, only Coastal Carolina University, the Medical University of South Carolina (MUSC), and USC-Aiken were found to be in complete compliance with program productivity standards. These institutions are to be commended for achieving such an accomplishment. Institutions with the largest number of noncompliant programs were USC-Columbia (15), Clemson University (6), S.C. State University (6), and Winthrop University (4).

Of the programs identified this year, fifteen were recommended by CHE staff and approved by Commission members for provisional approval status. Among these programs, institutions submitted plans of corrective action for ten programs and Notification of Termination forms for two programs. For the three remaining programs, institutions submitted appeals requesting reconsideration of program status to be changed from "provisional approval" to "exemption" status. Program-specific results, institutional responses, and staff recommendations are presented on pages 10-28 of this report. Plans of corrective action for programs given provisional approval as well as requests for program terminations are summarized in the text on pages 10-19. The final section of this report titled *Institutional Appeals for Reconsideration* contains appeals from certain institutions for reconsideration of program status (pp. 19-28). A complete list of all of the programs found to be noncompliant with program productivity standards for 1998-2003 is presented in **Table 1** (see **Attachment 1**), which is extracted from the 2004 report approved by the Commission.

II. Plans of Corrective Action Submitted for Noncompliant Programs Granted Provisional Approval

This section of the report contains information related to programs recommended for provisional approval for which institutions submitted a plan of corrective action to improve the productivity of a program. Of the programs identified this year as being noncompliant with program productivity standards, fifteen were recommended by CHE staff and approved by Commission members for provisional approval status. CHE staff has reviewed each plan of corrective action and thanks the institutions for their thoughtful consideration of ways to improve the productivity of their programs. According to productivity policy, there is a two-year cycle before noncompliant programs are re-evaluated. CHE staff will review each of the programs again every two years, and institutions have up to two review cycles to improve programs to bring them in compliance with productivity standards. The improvement plans are discussed below by institution.

The Citadel
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Bachelor	German Language & Lit.	160501	10	2.6	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	French Language & Lit.	160901	6.6	0.8	Exemption	Provisional Approval

Institutional Response:

The Citadel has submitted a plan of corrective action to improve productivity in the programs leading to a Bachelor of Arts degree in **French** and **German** (see **Attachment 3**).

Recommendation 1.a:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept The Citadel's proposed plans of action for its German and French programs, until such time that the programs are able to implement the proposed plans of corrective action as outlined in **Attachment 3**, increasing enrollment and graduation numbers in compliance with Commission program productivity standards. Program approval status will be reconsidered in light of additional progress made by the next biennial productivity review.

Lander University
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Bachelor	Spanish Language & Lit.	160905	12.2	1.6	Exemption	Provisional Approval

Institutional Response:

Lander University submits a plan of corrective action that includes both short-term and long-term plans to improve productivity in the program leading to a Bachelor of Arts degree in **Spanish Language and Literature** and in particular its K-12 certification track. In relation to short-term plans, Lander states that this year the institution developed a proposal that was designed to support secondary certification programs, including Spanish. The proposal was submitted to a private foundation in August 2004. In early September, Lander received word that the proposal would be funded. Lander states that these funds will support the institution's efforts to increase enrollments in at least two academic programs, one of which is Spanish, for the next five years.

One of the senior faculty members in Spanish will retire in May 2005. The University plans to replace this faculty member with someone with experience in Spanish secondary certification programs. The faculty member will work as a part of a leadership team, which will be responsible for the coordination of all secondary certification programs within Lander University.

To buttress Lander's requirement that all Spanish graduates experience study abroad in a Spanish-language venue, the institution's Dean of the College of Arts and Humanities is seeking new grant money to support student travel and study abroad with scholarships. In addition, the budget for the University's study abroad program has been increased. As a result, one of Lander's new faculty members is developing a proposal to provide a study abroad experience for students in the program.

Lander also submitted long-term plans for improving productivity in the Spanish program. For instance, to increase the number of scholarships in Spanish, Lander sought and received funding from a private foundation. Funds from that proposal will be used to provide at least two new scholarships annually. The first two scholarships are to begin in the fall of 2005. In addition, the funding received will support the development of Spanish language day-camps for high school students during the summers. Because the funds to support these camps will not

be available until the spring of 2006, the first camp is planned for the summer of 2006. To garner interest in the Spanish program and in the language camps, Lander states that Spanish Club members will work with high school Spanish students, hosting them at Lander poetry readings and visiting their classes at local high schools. Spanish majors, especially those returned from study-abroad, will attend high school Spanish classes or Spanish Club meetings for "Total-Immersion" days.

Although the new hire, who will become the coordinator for the secondary certification program in Spanish, will not be hired until August 2005, Lander is currently implementing plans to meet the new National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education (NCATE) requirements for the Spanish secondary certification program. For example, Lander funded travel last year for a current faculty member to become familiar with the new standards. This faculty member was sent to Chicago for additional training in the American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages (ACTFL) standards during the fall 2004 semester. Last summer, this professor wrote a preliminary plan for Lander's Spanish program to be accredited under these new requirements, which he took to Chicago.

In addition, Lander hired two experienced Spanish faculty last year (i.e., 2003-04 academic year), which has allowed the major program to provide numerous extracurricular activities for minors and majors. For instance, during the 2003-04 academic year, these new faculty members initiated the re-chartering of the Spanish Club. Furthermore, the new faculty started two new Spanish-language groups that give majors in the Spanish program at Lander service-learning experiences in total-immersion-in Spanish situations. Visual indications of their re-invigorating the Spanish Club last fall included well-attended club meetings and t-shirts with club logos.

Lander is confident that the effort being put forth by the Spanish faculty and the University will increase the enrollment of Spanish majors and improve graduation rates as well as the number of K-12 certified Spanish teachers.

Recommendation 1.b:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept the proposed plan of action for the program leading to a Bachelor of Arts degree in **Spanish Language and Literature** at Lander University, until such time that the program is able to implement the proposed plan of corrective action as outlined above, increasing enrollment and graduation numbers in compliance with Commission program productivity standards. Program approval status will be reconsidered in light of additional progress made by the next biennial productivity review.

12

University of South Carolina-Columbia
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Bachelor	European Studies	50106	2	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Latin American Studies	50107	3.6	1.2	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master's	Health & Physical Educ.	310501	0.8	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval

Institutional Response:

The University of South Carolina-Columbia (USC-Columbia) submits a plan of corrective action to improve productivity in the programs leading to a Bachelor of Arts degree in **European Studies** and **Latin American Studies**, and the programs leading to a Master's degree in **Health and Physical Education**. USC-Columbia states that the program in European Studies as well as the program in Latin American Studies have been moved to the Walker Institute for International and Area Studies to increase visibility and recruitment for the programs. For the program in **European Studies**, the institution will reexamine the curricular requirements of the program (e.g., requirement of advanced foreign language proficiency, study abroad and mandatory senior thesis--making them options instead of mandatory requirements). The director of the Institute is planning to increase the number of scholarships offered to students for participation in study abroad programs. Furthermore, the institution plans to increase faculty in the area of European studies and expand the number of cross-listed courses offered in various units on campus.

USC-Columbia states that the faculty in **Latin American Studies** is working to inform students and academic advisors in the College of Liberal Arts and other colleges about the option of taking Latin American Studies. The institution plans to change the title of the program to *Latin American, Latino/a, and Carribbean Studies* to reflect a broader scope of program. In addition, faculty in the Latin American Studies program will be informing students and advisors next year about taking Latin American Studies as a double major.

USC-Columbia plans to re-examine the curricular requirements of the Latin American Studies program. The institution states that some of the presumed reasons so few students major in Latin American Studies may be due to a requirement for advanced foreign language proficiency and required study abroad.

The institution will reassess both requirements, perhaps making the study abroad an option rather than a requirement.

The new Director of the Walker Institute will also be working to expand the number of scholarships available for students in the program, especially scholarships for students to participate in study abroad opportunities. In addition, creative options for study abroad in Latin America beyond formal USC Maymester and summer programs will be explored. For example, reciprocal agreements recently established with universities in Brazil and Mexico may make it possible for students to pay USC tuition and attend one of these universities for a semester or a year, which would both enrich their educational experience and allow them to work study abroad into a program of study in a way that is convenient to each student. USC-Columbia plans to distribute materials that have been developed to promote the Bachelor of Arts degree in Latin American Studies in more venues, and a panel will be organized for the spring semester to allow current USC students to hear how USC alumni are using their LASP majors in their careers. Finally, the institution will work to involve a larger group of faculty with professional interests related to Latin American, Latino/a, and Caribbean Studies and expand the number of cross-listed courses offered in the program.

For the program leading to a Master's degree in **Health and Physical Education**, USC-Columbia plans to revise the program to make it more responsive to a specific population of underserved professionals. For instance, the institution has enrolled 15 students in the Master's of Science program as of Fall 2004. The institution has proposed to the College Curriculum Committee four new courses, as a result of enrollment, to compose a new track in Athletic Training. USC-Columbia expects that the implementation of such plans of action will attract new students who will be certified athletic trainers at the college level.

Recommendation 1.c:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept the proposed plans of action for the Bachelor of Arts degree program in **European Studies**, the Bachelor of Arts degree program in **Latin American Studies**, and the program leading to a Master's degree in **Health and Physical Education** at USC-Columbia, until such time that the programs are able to implement the proposed plans of corrective action as outlined above, increasing enrollment and graduation numbers in compliance with Commission program productivity standards. Program approval status will be reconsidered in light of additional progress made by the next biennial productivity review.

University of South Carolina-Upstate
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Bachelor	French Lang. & Lit.	160901	3.6	0.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Mathematics	270101	9.2	1.6	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Institutional Response:

The University of South Carolina-Upstate (USC-Upstate) submits a plan of corrective action to improve productivity in the program leading to a Bachelor of Arts degree in **French Language and Literature** and the program leading to a Bachelor of Science degree in **Mathematics**. For the **French** program the faculty has designed a multifaceted plan to increase the number of majors and graduates in French. USC-Upstate provides a timeline and dates for each course of action that will be taken to improve productivity in the French program (see **Attachment 2**).

For the **Mathematics** program, USC-Upstate has decided to merge the B.S. in Mathematics with the Computational Mathematics major (resulting in a combined sum of 15 majors). The institution states that the merger will create a coherent program with a pure concentration and a computational concentration in Mathematics. The new program should improve the productivity by combining the potential enrollments of the two existing programs. USC-Upstate expects the revised curriculum to enhance recruitment efforts of the program providing students the ability to pursue a broader range of careers that include computational applications of Mathematics.

USC-Upstate is actively seeking support to host an annual Mathematics contest for high school students throughout the surrounding counties for recruitment and to increase enrollment. For retention, the Math faculty is reassessing and redesigning the Math placement test, placement policy, advisement procedures, and the contents of freshmen Math courses to address the success rate in the Mathematics courses. USC-Upstate is also seeking approval to hire a full-time Math tutoring lab director to manage and redesign a tutoring lab with various tutoring service components for students (including one-on-one tutoring services and self-paced computerized tutoring modules with 24/7 availability.) The institution expects that the Mathematics contests will serve as an important

element in retention efforts by facilitating the Mathematics program in attracting more students capable of serving as tutors.

Finally, USC-Upstate's plan of corrective action will include a strategy for assessment to provide feedback to revisions of the above processes and ultimately the Math curriculum. The institution has some existing assessment mechanisms in place, but seeks to be granted an three-hour release time for a selected faculty member to formally assume the role of an assessment coordinator. The director will enhance the assessment apparatuses and processes and perform time-consuming assessment duties on a continuing basis.

Recommendation 1.d:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept the proposed plans of action for the program leading to a Bachelor of Arts degree in **French Language and Literature** and for the program leading to a Bachelor of Science degree in **Mathematics** at USC-Upstate, until such time that the programs are able to implement the proposed plans of corrective action as outlined above, increasing enrollment and graduation numbers in compliance with Commission program productivity standards. Program approval status will be reconsidered in light of additional progress made by the next biennial productivity review.

Winthrop University
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Master's	Art Teacher Educ.	131302	2.8	2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master's	Music Teacher Educ.	131312	3.2	2.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Institutional Response:

Winthrop University submits a plan of corrective action to improve productivity in the program leading to a Master's degree in **Art Teacher Education** and the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music Teacher Education**. For the Master's in **Music Teacher Education**, the Department of Music is engaged in the hiring process for a new music education specialist who

will have the background to direct certification programs in Orff and Kodaly, two very popular music education methodologies. This new faculty member will also have the responsibility to recruit students for the Master's of Music Education (MME) degree.

In addition, the Department of Music is seeking new and innovative ways to attract new students to the program, including:

- Considering offering additional courses online (one currently taught via Internet)
- Course scheduling that is more conducive to working teachers (e.g., additional summer courses, additional course offerings during the regular semesters in late afternoons and evenings
- Considering an off-campus cohort approach to this particular degree program

Therefore, Winthrop believes that with these new initiatives and the expertise of the new faculty member, coupled with the fine reputation of the University and the Department of Music, the program will meet program productivity requirements.

For the program leading to a Master's degree in **Art Teacher Education**, Winthrop states that there has been and continues to be a large market in the region for this degree program. However, the Department of Art and Design has determined that the programmatic structure currently in place does not meet the needs of the market. Therefore, the department will develop a new curriculum and structure during the 2004-05 academic year to make this program more convenient and accessible for potential students who in most cases are employed full-time.

Recommendation 1.e:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept the proposed plans of action for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Art Teacher Education** and for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music Teacher Education** at Winthrop University, until such time that the programs are able to implement the proposed plans of corrective action as outlined above, increasing enrollment and graduation numbers in compliance with Commission program productivity standards. Program approval status will be reconsidered in light of additional progress made by the next biennial productivity review.

III. Program Terminations

For the following programs, the institutions have chosen to terminate the program granted provisional approval. Notification of Termination forms have been submitted for the following programs.

University of South Carolina-Columbia
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
Doctoral	Health Education Administration	130499	1.8	0	Termination	Termination

Institutional Response:

USC-Columbia requests termination of the program leading to a Doctoral degree in **Health Education Administration**. The institution states that the Arnold School of Public Health and the College of Education were maintaining this collaborative degree as a service to the State, since it is the only doctoral program of its kind in the state. However, given the small numbers of students enrolled and completing the program, the faculty have agreed to terminate the program.

Recommendation 2.a:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept termination for the program leading to a Doctoral degree in **Health Education Administration** at USC-Columbia.

Winthrop University
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
Master's	Mathematics	270101	3.8	1.8	Termination	Termination

Institutional Response:

Winthrop University requests termination of the program leading to a Master's degree in **Mathematics**. The institution plans to close the program to new students effective January 2005. In addition, Winthrop expects that all currently enrolled students will have completed the program by December 2006.

Recommendation 2.b:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission accept termination for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Mathematics** at Winthrop University.

IV.   Institutional Appeals for Reconsideration

This section of the report contains institutional appeals for reconsideration of program status. According to the *S.C. Program Productivity Policy*, institutions in the state may "petition the Commission staff for possible exempt status for noncompliant programs by submitting a Petition for Exemption from Program Productivity Standards to the Commission staff" (see Procedure C.2 in the Policy). The following institutions have submitted requests for reconsideration of the Commission's approval of "provisional approval" status conferred by the CHE at its July 2004 meeting. In the tables that follow, the column labeled **Staff Recommendation** has "exemption" status for those programs in which CHE staff, as requested, has reconsidered the original recommendation of provisional approval and is now recommending exemption from program productivity standards for the program.

Clemson University
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
Master's	Biochemistry	260202	2.4	0.8	Exemption	Exemption

Discussion:

Clemson University requests reconsideration of exemption status for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Biochemistry** on the grounds that the

19

program is an important option for students who decide not to complete their doctoral studies, but instead choose to stop at the Master's degree. In addition, the institution consistently recruits students for the program in Biochemistry and has merged the faculty with the Department of Genetics and Biochemistry. Clemson requests that CHE consider changing the recommendation from provisional approval to exemption from program productivity standards for the Biochemistry program based on the program's function as a "stop out" program for the doctoral degree in Biochemistry.

According to Clemson officials, the Master's degree in Biochemistry is used as a "stop out" program for students who were originally enrolled in the doctoral program but chose not to complete the doctorate. The courses taken by students in the Master's program are the same courses that students are required to take in the doctoral program. Thus, no new courses are taught in these Master's programs that are not needed for the doctoral program.

Recommendation 3.a:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission grant exemption for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Biochemistry** at Clemson University from program productivity standards.

University of South Carolina-Columbia
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
Master's	Music History & Lit.	500902	1.6	0.2	Exemption	Exemption
Master's	Music Theory and Comp.	500904	5.6	1.2	Exemption	Exemption

Discussion:

USC-Columbia requests reconsideration of exemption status of the institution's program leading to a Master's degree in **Music History and Literature** and the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music Theory and Composition**. The institution states that both programs are: 1.) unique in South Carolina; 2.) the schools of music around the U.S. commonly experience very small enrollments in their Master's of Music programs in both Music History and Music Theory; 3.) a full array of courses in Music History and Music Theory is required by the National Association of Schools of Music for schools offering graduate degrees in music performance; 4.) and both the DMA and Ph.D. degrees require a Master's

degree in music for admission. The institution states that some of the students in these doctoral programs have been admitted after completing the Master's of Music degree in Music History and Music Theory.

For the record, staff initially suggested that USC-Columbia merge the two programs as tracks under one generic music program. To discover how these programs are structured at other institutions that offer them, the staff conducted background research of similar programs at the University of Florida, Florida State University, University of Michigan, University of Georgia, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, and the University of Virginia. The findings demonstrate that institutions across the nation typically do not offer Master's of Music degrees in music history and music theory as tracks under one generic music degree program. In addition, the National Association of Schools of Music, which is the accrediting agency for these programs, in its handbook designates programs in music history and music theory as specific Master's degrees. Furthermore, each of these programs is a unique program and the only one of its kind being offered by institutions in the state. Without their existence, there would be a void in these areas of study for students who are interested in pursuing degrees and careers in these fields. The staff recommends that USC-Columbia be allowed to retain such programs, so that students residing both within and outside of the state will be able to pursue degrees in these areas.

In discussion during its meeting on February 10, 2005, the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing expressed concern about low productivity in "unique" programs. The point was made that a program may be "unique" but there may in fact be little demand for it and resources should be allocated elsewhere. As a result of this discussion, USC-Columbia agreed to examine their programs and develop a plan of corrective action to be resubmitted to the staff by May 13, 2005.

Recommendation 3.b:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission grant exemption for the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music History and Literature** as well as the program leading to a Master's degree in **Music Theory and Composition** at USC-Columbia from program productivity standards with USC-Columbia to provide a plan of action with deadlines for improving enrollment to the staff by May 13, 2005. Each of these programs is a unique program and the only one of its kind being offered by institutions in the state. Without their existence, there would be a void in these areas of study for students who are interested in pursuing degrees and careers in these fields. However, the Committee felt that programs should be examined for their usefulness if student demand is so low.

Table 1:
Noncompliant Programs for Public Four-Year Institutions

Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Clemson University						
Bachelor	Pre-Pharmacy Studies	511103	0	3.2	Exemption	Exemption
Bachelor	Pre-Veterinary Studies	511104	0	2.2	Exemption	Exemption
Master's	Engineering Mechanics	141101	3.6	1.8	Termination	Termination
Master's	Biochemistry	260202	2.4	0.8	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Doctoral	Management Science	521301	3.4	0.8	Termination	Termination
Doctoral	Ceramic Science	140601	2.2	1	Termination	Termination
The Citadel						
Bachelor	German Language & Literature	160501	10	2.6	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	French Language & Literature	160901	6.6	0.8	Exemption	Provisional Approval
College of Charleston						
Bachelor	Pre-Dentistry Studies	511101	0	0	Exemption	Exemption
Bachelor	Pre-Medicine Studies	511102	0	0.2	Exemption	Exemption
Francis Marion University						
Bachelor	Geography	450701	0.6	0.2	Termination	Termination
Lander University						
Bachelor	Spanish Language & Literature	160905	12.2	1.6	Exemption	Provisional Approval
SC State University						
Bachelor	Art Teacher Education	131302	6.2	0.2	Defer Action on Program	CHE Action Deferred
Bachelor	Health Teacher Education	131307	4.8	0.6	Defer Action on Program	CHE Action Deferred
Bachelor	Spanish Language & Lit.	160905	1.4	0.8	Defer Action on Program	CHE Action Deferred
Bachelor	Physics, General	400801	5.2	1.4	Defer Action on Program	CHE Action Deferred
Bachelor	Music Performance	500903	9	1.2	Defer Action on Program	CHE Action Deferred
Bachelor	French Lang. & Literature	500903	0.4	0.2	Defer Action on Program	CHE Action Deferred

| | | | Enroll. | Compl. | Institutional | CHE |
Degree	Program	CIP	Average	Average	Request	Decision
Bachelor	European Studies	50106	2	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Latin American Studies	50107	3.6	1.2	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Italian Lang. & Literature	160902	1.4	0.4	Exemption	Exemption
Bachelor	Classics & Classical Lang.	161200	10.2	2	Exemption	Exemption
Bachelor	Interdisciplinary Studies	240199	10.4	4.4	Exemption	Exemption
Bachelor	Geophysics & Seismology	400603	4.4	0.6	Exemption	Exemption
Master's	Educational Evaluation & Research	130601	4.8	1.8	Exemption	Exemption[2]
Master's	Health Teacher Education	131307	2.8	2	Exemption	Full Approval
Master's	Comparative Literature	160104	4	0.8	Exemption	Exemption
Master's	Health & Physical Educ.	310501	0.8	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master's	Music History & Lit.	500902	1.6	0.2	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master's	Music Theory and Comp.	500904	5.6	1.2	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master's	Opera Theatre	500908	2.8	2	Exemption	Exemption
Master's	Medical Pharmacology	512003	1.4	0.4	Exemption	Exemption
Doctoral	Health Education Administration	130499	1.8	0	Exemption	Provisional Approval

USC-Columbia

[1] See, *Program Productivity Report for SC State University, Fall 1998-Fall 2003* for update.

[2] Changed from staff recommendation of "provisional approval" to institution request of "exemption" status.

23

			USC-Spartanburg			
Degree	Program	CIP	Enroll. Average	Compl. Average	Institutional Request	CHE Decision
Bachelor	French Lang. & Lit.	160901	3.6	0.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Spanish Lang. & Lit.	160905	12.4	2.4	Provisional Approval	Full Approval
Bachelor	Mathematics	270101	9.2	1.6	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
			Winthrop University			
Bachelor	Science Communication	231101	4.6	1.4	Full Approval	Exemption
Master's	Art Teacher Educ.	131302	2.8	2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master's	Music Teacher Educ.	131312	3.2	2.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master's	Mathematics	270101	3.8	1.8	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Plan of Action for B.A. Degree in French Program at USC-Upstate

I. Increase visibility of the French Program
    A. Promote French as part of the Foreign Language Information Booth (9/20/04) French Faculty
    B. Work with Office of Admissions to include French and other languages in recruiting activities in high schools (Fall 2004) French Faculty
    C. Work with American Association of Teachers of French (AATF) Ambassadors to create more interest in French among high school students (Fall 2004/Spring 2005) French Faculty
    D. Develop bookmarks detailing the advantages of the French major for use at USC-Upstate Open House and Other campus recruitment activities (Fall 2004) French Faculty

II. review program of study for possible revisions
    A. Increase the number of course options in an effort to make the degree requirements less rigid (Fall 2004) French Faculty
    B. Vary the number of "Special Topics" courses to make the major more attractive (Fall 2004) French Faculty

III. Investigate and develop new opportunities for French majors and minors
    A. Meet with the Dean of the School of Business to promote the minor in French for those concentrating in International Business (Fall 2004) French Faculty
    B. Meet with Academic Coordinator for Athletics to explore the possibility of promoting the French minor for athletes with experience in European languages (Fall 2004) French Faculty and LLC Chair
    C. Expand Study Abroad opportunities
        1. Plan a study abroad trip to Mornlandy and Paris for Summer 2005 (Fall 2004/Spring 2005) French Faculty
        2. Plan a study abroad trip to French-speaking Canada (Fall 2005) French Faculty
        3. Investigate a joint study abroad venture with the Art Faculty (Spring 2005) French Faculty

IV. Investigate long-range plans as appropriate
    A. Research converting the French major to a major in "European Culture and Thought" (Spring 2005 and forward) Language Faculty and LLC Chair

Plan of Action for B.A. Degree in Foreign Language Programs at The Citadel

French

- Two advanced students of French will be sent to Paris for two weeks of cultural immersion and enrichment during summer 2005 as guests of the Société des Fils de la Révolution Américaine--an arrangement to be finalized by March 2005. We feel it is important that the entire student body is aware of such opportunities, and these students will be required to write articles for the student newspaper on their experiences.

- One of three Olmsted Cadet Travel and Cultural Immersion Program grants allocated to The Citadel will be reserved for an advanced student of French to spend two weeks during summer 2005 in intensive language training in France. In this program, the Department of Modern Languages will work with the ROTC Detachment Commanders to select this student who must be contracted for military service. This effort will illustrate for our ROTC students that language study can be very valuable to a career in the military.

- The Citadel will supplement by $1000 the $3,333 provided by the Olmsted Cadet Travel and Cultural Immersion Program grant in order to allow the grantee in French to maximize his/her experience abroad through travel to sites of historical and cultural significance;

- In spring 2005, junior-level, interdisciplinary honors seminar will be proposed on the topic "Empire's End: French Decolonization in Africa and Southeast Asia," a course to increase throughout the College awareness of the legacy of French imperialism and parallels to the American experience in Vietnam, Afghanistan, and Iraq.

- A seminar on French music will be offered in fall 2005 for advanced students of French.

German

- Once again this year, the German Studies Summer Stipend, an annual award in the amount of $1,000, to assist an undergraduate German major with a proposed summer-study project in Europe.

- Once again this summer, the Deutscher brüderlicher Bund Sommer-Stipendium, an annual award to assist and undergraduate German major with a proposed summer-study project in Europe.

- One of three Olmsted Cadet Travel and Cultural Immersion Program grants allocated to The Citadel will be reserved for an advanced student of German to spend two weeks during summer 2005 in intensive language training in Germany. In this program, the Department of Modern Languages will work with the ROTC Detachment Commanders to select this student who must be contracted for military service. This effort will illustrate for our ROTC students that language study can be very valuable to a career in the military.

- The Citadel will supplement by $1000 the $3,333 provided by the Olmsted Cadet Travel and Cultural Immersion Program grant in order to allow the grantee in German to maximize his/her experience abroad through travel to sites of historical and cultural significance.

- The German Section of the Department of Modern Languages will nominate a qualified junior German major for the recently established summer seminar "The Grad-School Experience: Fellowships for Gifted Rising Seniors Majoring in German," to be held 11-18 August at the University of Pennsylvania.

1. Beginning in fall 2005, the Placement Process will be used more aggressively in identifying potential language majors. We believe the strengths of these programs will keep the commitment of these students once they have experienced them. Those entering students who are identified through high school transcript review or through strong scores on the placement test will be contacted personally regarding the selection of language as a major. We are in the process of developing a file of statements from past graduates regarding their experience with the language major and its impact on their lives. Those students who do not select a language major will be encouraged to pursue a language minor. The language minor has become increasingly attractive to our

students. Even in majors such as Business Administration, with only three non-Business electives, students are willing to take additional hours to experience a language minor. Placing ahead in the Core Curriculum Language sequence and earning by-pass credits also make the language minor more accessible. To recognize fully the impact of a language program on graduating students, The Citadel urges once again that the CHE consider both the number of majors and the number of minor in each language. This could be achieved by once again including as a measure of productivity the total credit hour production (FTES) at the 300- and 400-levels. Again, advanced preparation in a "critical need" area is infinitely better than no preparation at all.

2. Three years ago, the German Section instituted a teaching practicum for students considering graduate study in German with the goal of a teaching career. Students first observe, then plan, and finally teach one of our Core Curriculum courses for one week. This has been a very successful program from two perspectives. First, two of these students have been awarded Fulbrights to study in Germany, but an unexpected consequence is that younger students of language can see first-hand what they might become. The best recruiting tool for language might well be our successful language student, and this program will be explored by both French and Spanish Sections.